

Christopher Sproul (State Bar No. 126398)  
Stuart Wilcox (State Bar No. 327726)  
ENVIRONMENTAL ADVOCATES  
5135 Anza Street  
San Francisco, California 94121  
Telephone: (415) 533-3376  
Facsimile: (415) 358-5695  
Email: [csproul@enviroadvocates.com](mailto:csproul@enviroadvocates.com)  
[stuart.wilcox5@gmail.com](mailto:stuart.wilcox5@gmail.com)

Attorneys for Plaintiff  
Our Children's Earth Foundation

TODD KIM  
Assistant Attorney General

Hubert Lee (NY Bar #4992145)  
Environmental Defense Section  
Environment and Natural Resources Division  
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
P.O. Box 7611  
Washington, DC 20044

Attorneys for Defendant

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

OUR CHILDREN'S EARTH FOUNDATION, a  
non-profit corporation.

Civil Case No. 3:19-cv-7125-WHA

Plaintiff.

**SECOND STIPULATION TO MODIFY  
CONSENT DECREE DEADLINE AND  
PROPOSED ORDER**

ANDREW WHEELER, in his official capacity  
as Administrator of the United States  
Environmental Protection Agency

### Defendant

Pursuant to Civil L.R. 6-1(b), 6-2, 7-12, and paragraph 11 of the Consent Decree (“Consent Decree”) entered in this case (Dkt. No. 32-1), Plaintiff, Our Children’s Earth Foundation, and defendants, the United States Environmental Protection Agency *et al.* (“EPA”), (together, “the Parties”) stipulate to further continue the deadline for the appropriate EPA official to sign either: (i) a final rule containing revisions to National Emissions Standard for Hazardous Air Pollutants (“NESHAP”) Subpart M under section 112(d)(6) of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7412(d)(6); or (ii) a final determination under section 112(d)(6) not to revise NESHAP Subpart M, extending the deadline from June 1, 2023 to **February 1, 2024**.

On October 14, 2020, the Parties filed a motion to approve the Consent Decree to resolve claims Plaintiff brought against EPA. Dkt. No. 32. The Consent Decree included several deadlines where EPA (1) agreed to either review or revise New Source Performance Standards (“NSPS”) and NESHAPs governing a number of sources by dates certain and (2) agreed to sign either final rules or final determinations not to revise NSPSs and NESHAPs governing a number of sources by dates certain. *See* Consent Decree ¶¶ 2-8. The Court signed the Consent Decree on October 20, 2020. Dkt. No. 33.

Paragraph 11 of the Consent Decree provides that “[t]he deadlines set forth in Paragraphs 2–8 hereof may be modified only by: (a) written stipulation of the Parties with notice to the Court; or (b) the Court following motion of any party to this Consent Decree, pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, and upon consideration of any response by the non-moving party.” Consent Decree ¶ 11.

Paragraph 8.b of the Consent Decree specifically establishes that “EPA shall sign either: (i) a final rule containing revisions [to the Dry Cleaning Facilities: National Perchloroethylene Air Emission Standards NESHAP] Subpart M under section 112(d)(6) of the Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7412(d)(6); or (ii) a final determination under section 112(d)(6) not to revise NESHAP Subpart M” by no later than December 1, 2022. Consent Decree ¶ 8.b.

Invoking Paragraph 11 of the Consent Decree, on August 18, 2022, the Parties stipulated to continue the December 1, 2022 deadline to June 1, 2023, which was signed by the Court on August 19, 2022. Dkt. Nos. 41, 42. The Parties now stipulate to further continue the June 1, 2023 deadline to February 1, 2024.

The Parties agree that continuing the current June 1, 2023 deadline to February 1, 2024 for EPA to take final action as noted above is fair, reasonable, and in the public's interest. On December 14, 2022, EPA published a revised risk determination under the Toxic Substances Control Act ("TSCA") with respect to Perchloroethylene ("PCE") concluding "that PCE, as a whole chemical substance, presents an unreasonable risk of injury to health when evaluated under its conditions of use." 87 Fed. Reg. 76481 (Dec. 14, 2022). Because TSCA requires EPA to promulgate a rule "to the extent necessary so that [the chemical substance] no longer presents such risk," 15 U.S.C. § 2605(a), EPA is now in the process of developing a TSCA regulation with respect to PCE. 87 Fed. Reg. at 76487. EPA anticipates publishing its proposed TSCA PCE regulation sometime this spring. *See* OMB, Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs, Perchloroethylene; Rulemaking Under Section 6(a) of the Toxic Substances Control Act (TSCA), available at

<https://www.reginfo.gov/public/do/eAgendaViewRule?pubId=202210&RIN=2070-AK84> (last accessed March 28, 2023). Because the forthcoming TSCA rule regulating PCE will likely impact how EPA will address a NESHAP amendment for PCE with respect to dry cleaning facilities, the Parties agree that EPA will need more time to consider what final action it will take and agree that an extension of the deadline to February 1, 2024 is reasonable.

The Parties have only sought one other modification with respect to deadlines set forth in the Consent Decree and EPA has met every other Consent Decree deadline thus far. *See* Consent Decree ¶¶ 2.a, 3.a, 4.a, 4.b, 5.a, 6.a, 6.b, 7.a, 7.b, 8.a.

THEREFORE, the Parties stipulate to and request that the Court enter an order continuing the existing deadline of June 1, 2023 for the appropriate EPA official to sign “either: (i) a final rule containing revisions to [to the Dry Cleaning Facilities: National Perchloroethylene Air Emission Standards NESHAP] Subpart M under section 112(d)(6) of the Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7412(d)(6); or (ii) a final determination under section 112(d)(6) not to revise NESHAP Subpart M” to **February 1, 2024**. Respectfully submitted,

For Plaintiff:

/s/ *Stuart Wilcox*

---

Stuart Wilcox (State Bar No. 327726)  
ENVIRONMENTAL ADVOCATES

1 5135 Anza Street  
2 San Francisco, California 94121  
3 Telephone: (720) 331-0385  
4 Fax: (415) 358-5695  
5 Email: wilcox@enviroadvocates.com,

6 Attorney for Plaintiff  
7 Our Children's Earth Foundation

8 Dated: April 3, 2023

9 For Defendant:

10 Todd Kim  
11 Assistant Attorney General  
12 Environment & Natural Resources Division

13 /s/ Hubert T. Lee

14 Hubert Lee  
15 Environmental Defense Section  
16 Environment and Natural Resources Division  
17 U.S. Department of Justice  
18 P.O. Box 7611  
19 Washington, D.C. 20044

20 Dated: April 3, 2023

21 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2022

22 \_\_\_\_\_  
23 Hon. William Alsup  
24 United States District Judge

25  
26  
27